

**RECOGNITION OF KAFALA  
AND CHILD MARRIAGE IN FAMILY LAW  
AND MIGRATION LAW:  
PRIVATE INTERNATIONAL LAW  
BRIDGING THE GAP?**

Leontine BRUIJNEN



Responsible publisher: Peter Immink

© 2025 Wolters Kluwer Belgium nv/sa  
Text and data mining are not permitted.

Ragheno Business Park  
Motstraat 30  
2800 Mechelen

**Help & Support Center**

Motstraat 30  
2800 Mechelen  
Tel.: 015 78 76 00

[wkbe.be/klantendienst](http://wkbe.be/klantendienst)  
[wkbe.be/serviceclient](http://wkbe.be/serviceclient)  
[www.wolterskluwer.be](http://www.wolterskluwer.be)

Besides the exceptions expressly provided by law, no part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording or otherwise, without the prior written permission of the publisher.

No part of this publication may be used or stored in any application using artificial intelligence (AI) or similar application, including use for the purpose of training an AI application.

Use of (parts of) the content of this publication for text and data mining is not permitted.

D/2025/2664/211  
ISBN: 978-94-03-03997-8  
BP/DOCKAFA-BI25001

## Table of contents

|   |      |
|---|------|
| <b>Preface</b>  | V    |
| <b>List of abbreviations</b>  | XVII |
| <b>Part I: Introduction and methodology</b>   | 1    |
| I.1 Introductory remarks  | 3    |
| I.2 Background, problem statement and state of the art  | 5    |
| I.3 Research objective and central research question  | 9    |
| I.4 Concepts  | 10   |
| I.4.1 Kafala  | 10   |
| I.4.2 Child marriage  | 13   |
| I.5 Importance and impact of the research   | 16   |
| I.6 Research methods  | 18   |
| I.6.1 Traditional legal research  | 18   |
| I.6.2 Focus group discussions   | 19   |
| I.7 The Belgian and German court systems  | 20   |
| I.8 Delimitations   | 23   |
| I.9 Structure of the book   | 24   |
| <b>Part II: The private international law, family law and migration law context</b>                   | 27   |
| Chapter 1: Private international law and substantive family law framework relating to kafala          | 29   |
| 1.1. Characterisation of kafala   | 29   |
| 1.2. International PIL framework: the 1996 Hague Child Protection Convention                          | 31   |
| 1.2.1. Background of the 1996 Hague Convention and its relation to the 1993 Hague Adoption Convention | 31   |
| 1.2.2. Legal framework under the 1996 Hague Convention  | 34   |
| 1.2.2.a. Makful lives in the country of origin or country where kafala is established                 | 35   |
| 1.2.2.b. Makful lives in the receiving country (Belgium or Germany) and kafala is established         | 39   |
| 1.3. EU PIL framework: Brussels IIb   | 41   |
| 1.4. Domestic PIL and family law framework: Belgium   | 42   |
| 1.4.1. Belgian domestic PIL   | 43   |
| 1.4.2. Recognition of the legal consequences of a kafala  | 45   |
| Recognition of kafala and child marriage in family law and migration law                              | VII  |

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|   |    |
|---|----|
| 1.4.3. Belgian substantive law  | 47 |
| 1.4.3.a. Unofficial guardianship  | 47 |
| 1.4.3.b. Adoption   | 48 |
| 1.4.4. Belgian domestic PIL and family law framework:<br>concluding remarks                               | 49 |
| 1.5. Domestic PIL and family law framework: Germany   | 50 |
| 1.5.1. Characterisation of kafala   | 50 |
| 1.5.2. German domestic PIL  | 51 |
| 1.5.3. Recognition of the legal consequences of a kafala  | 55 |
| 1.5.4. German substantive law   | 57 |
| 1.5.5.a. Guardianship   | 57 |
| 1.5.5.b. Adoption   | 58 |
| 1.5.5. German domestic PIL and family law framework:<br>concluding remarks                                | 60 |
| Chapter 2: Private international law and substantive family law frame-<br>work relating to child marriage | 61 |
| 2.1. International PIL framework: Hague Conventions and the 1951<br>Geneva Convention                     | 61 |
| 2.2. EU PIL framework: Brussels IIb and Rome III  | 66 |
| 2.3. Domestic PIL and family law framework: Belgium   | 67 |
| 2.3.1. Belgian domestic PIL   | 67 |
| 2.3.2. Belgian substantive law  | 70 |
| 2.3.3. Proposal to amend the Code of PIL regarding the<br>recognition of foreign child marriages          | 71 |
| 2.4. Domestic PIL and family law framework: Germany   | 76 |
| 2.4.1. Background regarding the Law to Combat Child Marriages   | 76 |
| 2.4.2. German substantive law   | 79 |
| 2.4.2.a. Legislation before 22 July 2017: spouse be-<br>tween the age of 16 and 18 years                  | 79 |
| 2.4.2.b. Legislation before 22 July 2017: spouse under<br>the age of 16 years                             | 80 |
| 2.4.2.c. Legislation before 22 July 2017: consequences<br>of annulment                                    | 80 |
| 2.4.2.d. Legislation after 22 July 2017: spouse between<br>the age of 16 and 18 years                     | 81 |
| 2.4.2.e. Legislation after 22 July 2017: spouse under the<br>age of 16 years                              | 83 |
| 2.4.2.f. Legislation after 22 July 2017: parental respon-<br>sibility                                     | 85 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| 2.4.3. German domestic PIL  | 86  |
| 2.4.3.a. General rules on child marriage in EGBGB   | 86  |
| 2.4.3.b. Some critical remarks regarding the Law to<br>Combat Child Marriages   | 89  |
| 2.4.3.c. Transitional provision on child marriage in EGBGB  | 92  |
| 2.4.3.d. PIL framework regarding the annulment of a<br>child marriage   | 94  |
| 2.4.3.e. Schematic overview of the legislation before<br>and after the introduction of the Law to Combat<br>Child Marriages | 95  |
| 2.4.4. Judgment of the Constitutional Court on the<br>compatibility of article 13(3)(1) EGBGB with the Basic Law            | 98  |
| 2.4.5. The Law for the Protection of Minors in Foreign Marriages  | 103 |
| Chapter 3: Migration law framework  | 105 |
| 3.1. Harmonisation of migration law at the EU level   | 105 |
| 3.2. Migration scenarios relevant to this book  | 107 |
| 3.3. Migration of mobile EU citizens and their family members   | 111 |
| 3.3.1. Citizenship Directive  | 111 |
| 3.3.2. Application of the Citizenship Directive when EU<br>citizens return to their country of nationality                  | 121 |
| 3.4. Position of static EU citizens and their family members  | 123 |
| 3.4.1. Position of static EU citizens as a matter of EU law   | 123 |
| 3.4.2. National legal framework for family reunification with a<br>static citizen   | 126 |
| 3.4.2.a. Migration of a static German national with their<br>family members   | 127 |
| 3.4.2.b. Migration of a static Belgian national with their<br>family members  | 128 |
| 3.5. Migration of third-country nationals and their family members  | 129 |
| 3.5.1. Family reunification with the nuclear family   | 131 |
| 3.5.2. Family reunification with other family members   | 137 |
| 3.5.3. Required documents for family reunification  | 139 |
| 3.5.4. Family Reunification Directive: concluding remarks   | 140 |
| 3.6. Migration of persons seeking international protection  | 141 |
| 3.6.1. The Common European Asylum System  | 141 |
| 3.6.2. The Pact on Migration and Asylum   | 145 |
| 3.6.3. Migration of persons seeking international protection:<br>concluding remarks   | 147 |

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Chapter 4: Factors in context  | 149 |
| 4.1. The use of private international law  | 150 |
| 4.2. EU principles   | 153 |
| 4.2.1. The principle of non-discrimination   | 154 |
| 4.2.2. The right to free movement  | 155 |
| 4.2.3. Mutual recognition and mutual trust   | 162 |
| 4.3. Public policy   | 163 |
| 4.3.1. Public policy under private international law   | 164 |
| 4.3.2. Codification of public policy in international and EU private international law instruments | 167 |
| 4.3.3. Codification of public policy in Belgian private international law                          | 169 |
| 4.3.4. Codification of public policy in German private international law                           | 171 |
| 4.3.5. Public policy under migration law   | 172 |
| 4.3.5.a. Public policy under the Citizenship Directive   | 173 |
| 4.3.5.b. Public policy under the Family Reunification Directive                                    | 175 |
| 4.3.6. Public policy under private international law versus public policy under migration law      | 177 |
| 4.4. The best interests of the child   | 178 |
| 4.4.1. The principle of the best interests of the child  | 180 |
| 4.4.2. Article 10 CRC: family reunification  | 185 |
| 4.4.3. Relevant views adopted by the CRC Committee: <i>Y.B. and N.S. v. Belgium</i>                | 187 |
| 4.4.4. Article 20 CRC: alternative care  | 191 |
| 4.4.5. Article 21 CRC: adoption  | 195 |
| 4.4.6. Charter of Fundamental Rights of the European Union   | 197 |
| 4.4.7. Implementation of the best-interests principle in national legislation                      | 198 |
| 4.4.8. Concluding remarks regarding the best interests of the child                                | 202 |
| 4.5. The right to private and family life  | 203 |
| 4.5.1. The European Convention on Human Rights and the European Court of Human Rights              | 203 |
| 4.5.2. Article 8 ECHR: the right to private and family life  | 205 |
| 4.5.3. ECtHR's application of the right to private and family life to kafala                       | 210 |
| 4.5.3.a. <i>Harroudj v. France</i>   | 210 |
| 4.5.3.b. <i>Chbihi Loudoudi and others v. Belgium</i>  | 215 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 4.5.4. ECtHR's application of the right to private and family life to child marriage                             | 222 |
| 4.5.4.a. <i>Khan v. the United Kingdom</i>   | 223 |
| 4.5.4.b. <i>Z.H. and R.H. v. Switzerland</i> : national procedure and reasoning of the ECtHR                     | 224 |
| 4.5.4.c. <i>Z.H. and R.H. v. Switzerland</i> : concurring opinion  | 226 |
| 4.5.4.d. Some observations regarding <i>Z.H. and R.H. v. Switzerland</i>   | 228 |
| 4.5.5. Article 7 of the Charter: right to private and family life  | 231 |
| 4.5.6. Implementation of the right to private and family life in national legislation                            | 231 |
| 4.5.7. Concluding remarks regarding the right to private and family life   | 235 |
| 4.6. Principle of legal certainty  | 236 |
| 4.6.1. Principle of legal certainty  | 236 |
| 4.6.2. Theory of vested rights   | 238 |
| 4.6.3. The principle of legal certainty: lack of legal basis?  | 240 |
| <b>Part III: Case studies on kafala</b>  | 243 |
| Chapter 5: How is a kafala recognised for family law purposes?   | 245 |
| 5.1. Case study on kafala in Belgium   | 245 |
| 5.1.1. The use of private international law  | 245 |
| 5.1.1.a. Characterisation  | 246 |
| 5.1.1.b. Application of private international law recognition rules  | 247 |
| 5.1.1.c. Conversion of a kafala into an adoption   | 252 |
| 5.1.1.d. Concluding remarks regarding the use of private international law                                       | 267 |
| 5.1.2. EU principles   | 267 |
| 5.1.2.a. Recognition based on the original kafala  | 268 |
| 5.1.2.b. Recognition based on the recognition, non-recognition or conversion of the kafala in other Member State | 271 |
| 5.1.3. Public policy   | 278 |
| 5.1.4. The best interests of the child   | 281 |
| 5.1.4.a. Establishment and recognition of a kafala   | 282 |
| 5.1.4.b. Adoption of a makful  | 282 |
| 5.1.4.c. Concluding remarks regarding the best interests of the child  | 284 |
| Recognition of kafala and child marriage in family law and migration law   | XI  |

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| 5.1.5. The right to private and family life                                  | 284 |
| 5.1.6. Principle of legal certainty  | 285 |
| 5.2. Case study on kafala in Germany   | 288 |
| 5.2.1. The use of private international law                                  | 288 |
| 5.2.1.a. Characterisation  | 288 |
| 5.2.1.b. Application of private international law recognition rules          | 293 |
| 5.2.1.c. Conversion of a kafala into an adoption                             | 295 |
| 5.2.1.d. Concluding remarks regarding the use of private international law   | 300 |
| 5.2.2. EU principles   | 300 |
| 5.2.3. Public policy   | 304 |
| 5.2.4. The best interests of the child                                       | 306 |
| 5.2.5. The right to private and family life                                  | 308 |
| 5.2.6. Principle of legal certainty  | 309 |
| Chapter 6: How is a kafala recognised for migration law purposes?            | 313 |
| 6.1. Case study on kafala in Belgium   | 313 |
| 6.1.1. The use of private international law                                  | 313 |
| 6.1.1.a. Characterisation  | 314 |
| 6.1.1.b. The incomplete use of private international law                     | 324 |
| 6.1.1.c. Conversion of a kafala into an adoption                             | 329 |
| 6.1.1.d. Conversion of a kafala into an unofficial guardianship              | 330 |
| 6.1.1.e. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition of a kafala             | 331 |
| 6.1.1.f. The use of private international law: concluding remarks            | 350 |
| 6.1.2. EU principles   | 350 |
| 6.1.3. Public policy   | 355 |
| 6.1.4. The best interests of the child                                       | 357 |
| 6.1.4.a. Direct effect   | 358 |
| 6.1.4.b. Assessment of the best interests of the child in migration case law | 361 |
| 6.1.5. The right to private and family life                                  | 365 |
| 6.1.5.a. The existence of family life  | 365 |
| 6.1.5.b. The consequences of the existence of family life                    | 367 |
| 6.1.6. Principle of legal certainty  | 371 |



|   |      |
|---|------|
| 6.2. Case study on kafala in Germany  | 373  |
| 6.2.1. The use of private international law   | 373  |
| 6.2.1.a. Characterisation   | 374  |
| 6.2.1.b. The use of private international law   | 375  |
| 6.2.1.c. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition of<br>a kafala: visa based on the adoption of the makful | 377  |
| 6.2.1.d. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition of<br>a kafala: visa based on family reunification       | 379  |
| 6.2.1.e. The use of private international law: concluding<br>remarks  | 382  |
| 6.2.2. EU principles  | 382  |
| 6.2.3. Public policy  | 382  |
| 6.2.4. The best interests of the child  | 382  |
| 6.2.5. The right to private and family life   | 384  |
| 6.2.6. Principle of legal certainty   | 387  |
| <b>Part IV: Case studies on child marriage</b>  | 389  |
| Chapter 7: How is a child marriage recognised for family law purposes?  | 391  |
| 7.1. Case study on child marriage in Belgium  | 391  |
| 7.1.1. The use of private international law   | 391  |
| 7.1.1.a. The application of the Code of PIL and arti-<br>cle 12 of the 1951 Geneva Convention                 | 392  |
| 7.1.1.b. The absence of a legalised marriage certificate  | 399  |
| 7.1.1.c. Annulment  | 402  |
| 7.1.1.d. The use of private international law: concluding<br>remarks  | 407  |
| 7.1.2. EU principles  | 407  |
| 7.1.3. Public policy  | 409  |
| 7.1.4. The best interests of the child  | 414  |
| 7.1.5. The right to private and family life   | 416  |
| 7.1.6. Principle of legal certainty   | 419  |
| 7.2. Case study on child marriage in Germany  | 421  |
| 7.2.1. The use of private international law   | 421  |
| 7.2.1.a. The application of the EGBGB before the intro-<br>duction of the Law to Combat Child Marriages       | 422  |
| 7.2.1.b. Parental responsibility  | 424  |
| 7.2.1.c. Divorce versus annulment   | 427  |
| 7.2.1.d. The application of the EGBGB after the intro-<br>duction of the Law to Combat Child Marriages        | 432  |
| Recognition of kafala and child marriage in family law and migration law                                      | XIII |

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|          |   |     |
|----------|---|-----|
| 7.2.1.e. | Confirmation of a child marriage under § 1315 BGB   | 436 |
| 7.2.1.f. | Transitional provision of article 229 § 44 EGBGB  | 437 |
| 7.2.1.g. | The application of article 12 of the 1951 Geneva Convention and the 1902 Hague Convention                               | 441 |
| 7.2.1.h. | The use of private international law: concluding remarks  | 443 |
| 7.2.2.   | EU principles   | 444 |
| 7.2.2.a. | Influence of the right to free movement on the recognition of a child marriage under domestic private international law | 447 |
| 7.2.2.b. | Influence of the right to free movement on the migration law consequences of a child marriage                           | 449 |
| 7.2.2.c. | EU principles: concluding remarks   | 451 |
| 7.2.3.   | Public policy   | 451 |
| 7.2.3.a. | Public policy and <i>Inlandsbezug</i>   | 451 |
| 7.2.3.b. | Public policy and German family law   | 452 |
| 7.2.3.c. | Public policy and the best interests of the child   | 454 |
| 7.2.3.d. | Public policy and relevant circumstances of the case  | 457 |
| 7.2.3.e. | Public policy: concluding remarks   | 458 |
| 7.2.4.   | The best interests of the child   | 458 |
| 7.2.4.a. | Protecting a child versus respecting a child's autonomy   | 459 |
| 7.2.4.b. | The principle of the best interests of the child and the individual circumstances of the case                           | 459 |
| 7.2.4.c. | The interests of the children born in a child marriage  | 462 |
| 7.2.4.d. | The best interests of the child: concluding remarks   | 462 |
| 7.2.5.   | The right to private and family life  | 462 |
| 7.2.6.   | Principle of legal certainty  | 464 |
| 7.2.6.a. | The emergence of a limping legal situation  | 464 |
| 7.2.6.b. | The interaction between the recognition of a child marriage for family law and migration law purposes                   | 466 |
| 7.2.6.c. | Principle of legal certainty: concluding remarks  | 468 |

|   |     |
|---|-----|
| Chapter 8: How is a child marriage recognised for migration law purposes?   | 469 |
| 8.1. Case study on child marriage in Belgium  | 469 |
| 8.1.1. The use of private international law   | 469 |
| 8.1.1.a. The (correct) use of private international law   | 470 |
| 8.1.1.b. The incomplete use of private international law  | 473 |
| 8.1.1.c. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition of<br>a child marriage: family reunification as a spouse                           | 476 |
| 8.1.1.d. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition of<br>a child marriage: family reunification as a child                            | 477 |
| 8.1.1.e. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition of<br>a child marriage: unaccompanied minor  | 479 |
| 8.1.1.f. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition of<br>a child marriage: international protection                                   | 490 |
| 8.1.2. EU principles  | 496 |
| 8.1.2.a. Intra-EU recognition of a child marriage   | 497 |
| 8.1.2.b. Intra-EU recognition of guardianship of a mar-<br>ried child   | 501 |
| 8.1.3. Public policy  | 503 |
| 8.1.4. The best interests of the child  | 509 |
| 8.1.4.a. Influence of the best interests of the child on the<br>migration law consequences of the child marriage                        | 510 |
| 8.1.4.b. Determination of the best interests of the child<br>in case of a child marriage  | 514 |
| 8.1.4.c. Concluding remarks regarding the best interests<br>of the child  | 516 |
| 8.1.5. The right to private and family life   | 517 |
| 8.1.6. Principle of legal certainty   | 519 |
| 8.2. Case study on child marriage in Germany  | 524 |
| 8.2.1. The use of private international law   | 524 |
| 8.2.1.a. The (correct) use of private international law   | 524 |
| 8.2.1.b. The incomplete use of private international law  | 529 |
| 8.2.1.c. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition of<br>a child marriage: family reunification as a spouse                           | 532 |
| 8.2.1.d. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition<br>of a child marriage: family reunification with a<br>subsidiary protected spouse | 536 |
| 8.2.1.e. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition of<br>a child marriage: family asylum for the spouse                               | 537 |
| 8.2.1.f. Legal consequences of the (non-)recognition of<br>a child marriage: international protection                                   | 540 |

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|   |            |
|---|------------|
| 8.2.2. EU principles                        | 542        |
| 8.2.3. Public policy                        | 543        |
| 8.2.4. The best interests of the child      | 544        |
| 8.2.5. The right to private and family life | 545        |
| 8.2.6. Principle of legal certainty         | 546        |
| <b>Part V: Conclusions</b>                  | <b>549</b> |
| V.1 General conclusion                      | 551        |
| V.2 Conclusions regarding kafala            | 553        |
| V.2.1 Use of private international law      | 553        |
| V.2.2 EU principles                         | 559        |
| V.2.3 Public policy                         | 562        |
| V.2.4 The best interests of the child       | 562        |
| V.2.5 The right to private and family life  | 564        |
| V.2.6 Principle of legal certainty          | 565        |
| V.3 Conclusions regarding child marriage    | 567        |
| V.3.1 Use of private international law      | 567        |
| V.3.2 EU principles                         | 571        |
| V.3.3 Public policy                         | 574        |
| V.3.4 The best interests of the child       | 576        |
| V.3.5 The right to private and family life  | 578        |
| V.3.6 Principle of legal certainty          | 578        |
| V.4 Proposal for a way forward              | 579        |